

Distr.  
RESTRICTED  
GM/R.13  
14 October 1997

UNITED NATIONS  
INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT ORGANIZATION

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

---

**ASSISTANCE TO ENHANCE TECHNICAL AND ENTREPRENEURIAL  
SKILLS OF BUSINESS WOMEN IN TEXTILE AND  
RELATED PRODUCTS**

US/URT/94/015

**UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA**

**Report of the evaluation mission\***

---

\* This document has not been edited.

**EXPLANATORY NOTES**

ADAT	Artisan Development Agency of Tanzania
BET	Board of External Trade
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
FAWETA	Federation of Associations of Women Entrepreneurs of Tanzania
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
MCDWAC	Ministry of Community Development, Women's Affairs and Children
MIT	Ministry of Industry and Trade
MOB	Management by Objective
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NORAD	Norwegian Multilateral and Bilateral Assistance Programme
NPC	National Project Coordinator
PPR	Project Progress Report
SDC	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation
SEBA	SERO Businesswomen Association
SELFINA	SERO Leasing and Finance Company
SIDO	Small Industries Development Organization
TCDC	Technical Cooperation among Developing Countries
TOT	Training of Trainers
TRM	Tripartite Review Meeting
UCD	UNIDO Country Director

1 US Dollar = 617 Tanzanian Shilling (TSh) (September, 1997)

## Table of Contents

	Page
<b>EXPLANATORY NOTES.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN .....</b>	<b>6</b>
2.1 Socio-economic context .....	6
2.2 Institutional framework .....	6
2.3 Relevance .....	6
2.4 Project Design.....	7
<b>3. IMPLEMENTATION.....</b>	<b>8</b>
3.1 Budget and expenditures .....	8
3.2 Delivery of UNIDO inputs .....	8
3.3 Delivery of client_s inputs.....	9
3.4 Activities /Use of the inputs.....	10
3.5 Assumptions .....	10
3.6 Project management.....	10
<b>4. RESULTS.....</b>	<b>12</b>
4.1 Production of outputs.....	12
4.2 Achievement of the immediate objective .....	14
4.3 Contribution to the development objective .....	15
4.4 Sustainability .....	15
<b>5. CONCLUSIONS.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>6. RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>7. LESSONS LEARNED .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>ANNEX 1:</b> Terms of Reference of the in-depth evaluation mission	
<b>ANNEX 2:</b> Organizations visited and persons met	
<b>ANNEX 3:</b>	
<b>A - D</b> Work Plans	
<b>ANNEX 4:</b> Evaluation Data Sheet	

## SUMMARY

### Background

The manufacturing sector in Tanzania is still in its early stages of development and still predominantly concerned with the production of consumer goods. The textile sector is particularly important as it accounts for some 37% of the employment in manufacturing. This sub-sector is being drastically restructured and modernized, with the inevitable reduction of the labour force. As a consequence, the Government is focusing attention on the development of the informal sector in order to incorporate it in the national economic planning process. The Government also remains strongly committed to the advancement of the socio-economic status of women and channels its efforts in this area through the Ministry of Community Development, Women's Affairs and Children, who is the Government counterpart agency for this particular project.

### The project

The project is basically a group training project with the objective of enhancing the technical and entrepreneurial capabilities of Tanzanian businesswomen manufacturing textiles and related products. The training was conducted by six national trainers, covering between them technical production details, fashion and marketing aspects as well as business management. Five courses of six months duration and with an average of 35 participants were organized during the project. The classroom work was limited to three days a week to permit the trainees to continue their bread-winning activities. The instructors made regular visits to the trainees' workshops to ensure correct application of the techniques learned. The progress was monitored and recorded in the project's computerized database.

A CTA and a National Project Coordinator have shared the local management and administration of the project, with a gradual transfer of responsibilities from the CTA to the National Project Coordinator. The total budget was US\$1,109,900. The project was financed by the Swiss Development Cooperation through UNIDO.

### Implementation and results

160 women entrepreneurs were trained during the project's three-year life, in addition to 22 trainers to continue the training activity outside the project. Assuming that these, in turn, each trained another 10 businesswomen, the total number of women entrepreneurs directly and indirectly reached by the project was about 400. This number could have been significantly higher had it not been for the constraint of inadequate premises.

Monitoring the effect of the training both during and after showed that more than 75 per cent of the trainees had significantly improved their businesses as a direct result of the training and that the effect was durable. The training fees charged (TSh 35,000 per person) did not cover more than 3 percent of the actual costs of the training, and the operation was thus not financially viable. Increasing the fees significantly would not be advisable as that would exclude the very category of trainees the center aims to reach.

### Conclusions

In terms of direct support the project has accomplished what it was set up to do, but the facility which implemented the programme, cannot continue its operations without continuing financial support and would have to be dismantled when external funding ceases in January 1998. In view of the pressing need to develop the informal sector which this project has addressed, it is strongly recommended that continuing financial support be sought for this facility which has demonstrated its competence, motivation and ability to produce results.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

During the Tripartite Review Meeting dated 30th January 1997, the representatives of the Ministry of Community Development Women's Affairs and Children (MCDWAC) expressed the Government's full satisfaction with the progress of the project and recommended that preparations be made for its extension for further three years beyond its current termination date of mid - January 1998. The Ministry representatives, however, requested that an in-depth evaluation be carried out before deciding what the project's possible future scope and administrative structure should be.

It is foreseen in the Project Document (para 4.6) that there would be a progressive transfer of responsibility for the implementation of the project from UNIDO to an association or a Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) which could, possibly, evolve from the project's beneficiaries and staff. Accordingly, the project staff and several other interested individuals had formed an NGO called Artisan Development Agency of Tanzania (ADAT) which was registered as a legal entity on 17th September 1996. This NGO, in UNIDO's and Ministry's view, would be an appropriate administrative structure during subsequent phases of the project.

The project's funding agencies, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperative (SDC) and MCDWAC cleared the terms of reference as enclosed in Annex 1 and approved the requisite budgetary provision for the evaluation (Budget revision F. dated June 1997).

The evaluation team members were: Mr. Antero Eraneva, international consultant and Ms. Hilda Mafwenga, national consultant. Following a briefing at UNIDO Headquarters in Vienna, Mr. Eraneva arrived in Tanzania on 18 September 1997 and departed on 2 October. Ms. Mafwenga started her assignment on 1 September 1997 and completed it on 30 September 1997.

## **2. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN**

### **2.1 Socio-economic context**

The socio-economic setting in Tanzania has not changed significantly since the project was first formulated and approved. The manufacturing sector is still in its early stages of development and still predominantly concerned with the production of food, beverages, tobacco, leather goods and textiles. The textile sub-sector is particularly important as it accounts for some 37% of the employment provided by the manufacturing sector. This sub-sector is being drastically restructured and modernized with the inevitable reduction of the labor force. This last point has forced the Government to focus attention on the need to develop the informal sector in order to incorporate it into the national economic planning process.

The Government remains strongly committed to the advancement of the socio-economic status of women and channels its efforts in this area through the Ministry of Community Development, Women's Affairs and Children, who is the Government counterpart agency for this particular project.

### **2.2 Institutional framework**

While organizationally attached to Ministry of Community Development Women's Affairs and Children, the project maintained contact with other organizations and institutions active in the same field of the development of small-scale enterprises, such as Small Industry Development (SIDO), Board of External Trade (BET) in connection with participation in trade fairs and exhibitions, Federation of Business Entrepreneurs of Tanzania (FBET), SERO Business Women Association (SEBA) and SERO/SELFINA in connection with credit facilities for small-scale entrepreneurs. Also the Ministry of Industry and Trade (MIT) was aware of and involved itself in the activities of the project.

The responsibility for the implementation lay with UNIDO but, in accordance with the Project Document, a non-governmental organization ADAT was established through the initiative of the project's national staff with the objective of taking over project activities after the termination of UNIDO's involvement.

### **2.3 Relevance**

There is no doubt that the project is as valid today as it was three years ago when it was first conceived. It would have significantly exceeded its targets had it not been for the constraint of inadequate premises.

The informal sector, whence the project's trainees come, in 1992 employed about 2,415,000 persons of which some 35% (845,000) were women<sup>1</sup>. It is estimated that about 15% of that number (127,000) are women running small textile businesses, most of them trying to make their businesses grow. These 127,000, then, are the main reservoir from which the trainees for a project such as this are drawn. Even if only ten per cent of this number could be reached it would still mean training 12,700 women entrepreneurs. Comparing this figure with the number of persons actually trained by this project shows how desperately relevant the project is.

The Ministry (MCDWAC) is stepping up its efforts to support small-scale enterprises - especially those run by women - and considering, among other things, the establishment of a Women Producers and Consumers Promotion Association whose main objective is to promote and encourage the development of small and medium scale women entrepreneurs through established internal and external market linkages.

---

<sup>1</sup>Source: Labour Force Survey

The project continues to be in line with UNIDO's stated priorities and falls within the Organization's demonstrated capabilities. The problem the project deals with is explicitly stated in the Project Document as are its beneficiaries and the delineation between capacity building and direct support.

## 2.4 Project design

This direct support project has only one immediate objective:

To enhance the product design and quality and the entrepreneurial capabilities of business women manufacturing textiles and related products.

Against this objective the eleven outputs and related activities are clearly and logically stated. They were also realistic, as the achievement of the project's quantified targets bears out. There were no formal amendments during the implementation of the project, but there was one departure from the original plan: 22 additional trainers were trained to serve other regions while keeping the project's training staff (6) at the level originally planned.

The Project Document does not refer to assumptions as such but paragraph F "Risks" on page 21 of the ProDoc discusses issues that are not really risks but, more correctly, assumptions. In particular, the availability of premises is not a risk; if it were, it should have been eliminated from the outset. It is given in the subsequent paragraph "G" as a prior obligation for starting the project, but this was not fulfilled. This disregard of agreed prerequisites (the Government's obligation to provide appropriate premises for the project is stated no less than five times in the Project Document) is an issue which would merit a high-level policy discussion.

Also the future "ownership", as it is called in the Project Document (responsibility would be a more appropriate word) of the project is not a risk. If there aren't any existing NGOs to which the project could eventually be attached one could always form one, which is exactly what happened. Similarly, the availability of qualified counterpart staff could have been stated as given rather than a "low risk".

### **3. IMPLEMENTATION**

#### **3.1 Budget and expenditures**

The table below shows the breakdown of project expenditures in the five budget revisions made during the project's life.

The first budget increase (US\$126,500) was in the 3rd revision in September 1996, and the main reason for the increase was that the CTA post had been originally budgeted at a lower level than actually filled (L 6). Budget line 11-01 (CTA) was thus increased by US\$108,500.

The increase on budget line 43-00 (premises) was due to the fact that the rent for the premises had to be paid from the project budget as the Government was unable to provide suitable accommodation for the project.

The second increase (US\$21,000) was in June 1997 to cover the cost of the in-depth evaluation.

#### **3.2 Delivery of UNIDO Inputs**

##### **Personnel**

##### (a) National

There were no delays in the recruitment of the national project persons. Both the National Project Coordinator (NPC) and the first five trainers were on board as scheduled in March 1995. The sixth trainer was recruited in July 1996 in accordance with project activities. All are well qualified in their respective fields covering, between them: product development and design, quality control, construction techniques, machine maintenance, business management skills, marketing and promotional skills. Their average cost at about US\$1,200 per work month must be regarded as reasonable.

##### (b) International

There is only one internationally recruited project staff member, the CTA, appointed in January 1995. She is well qualified for the assignment and had demonstrated her ability as the CTA of a recently completed similar project in Kenya.

##### **Training**

The NPC and the five national trainers recruited in March 1995 were initially taken by the CTA to Kenya for a month's exposure to the operations of the UNIDO project there (Jua Kali Women's Textile Project, DP/KEN/90/019) there. This intensive study tour enabled the Tanzanian staff, upon return, to start their project operations with confidence and without any major start-up problems.

##### **Equipment**

Apart from the second project vehicle whose delivery was late (6 months), all other project equipment was delivered practically on schedule and in accordance with the agreed specifications. The cost exceeded the original budget by about 20%.

(Budget revisions)

### 3.3 Delivery of the client\_s inputs

According to the Project Document the Ministry of Community Development, Women\_s Affairs and Children will provide premises and logistic support@

Initially, space was allocated for the project on the premises of Tanzania Bureau of Standards (TBS) and during the first 18 months the project was housed there, the Ministry contributed TShs.6,847,500 towards the rent while US\$6,600 was paid from the project budget.

In 1996 the project moved to its present premises rented from an NGO called Nyumba ya Sanaa (House of Art) and the entire rent (US\$1,000/month) is paid from the project budget. The @logistic support@ refers to the issuance of customs clearances, work permits, etc.

### 3.4 Activities/use of the inputs

The project uses both long-term and short-term work plans and monitors the progress regularly at all levels.

Among the first activities of the project was a complete review of the Project Document with all members of the staff to ensure that there was full understanding of the objectives, outputs and activities. A tentative work plan for the project as a whole was then produced (Annex 3A) and this was updated on a yearly basis (see example in Annex 3B). Short-term goals are being addressed on a monthly basis by each trainer using the @management by objective (MBO)@ approach. An example of this is attached as Annex 3C. In this example the course content is first outlined (in this case textile design and surface finishing), followed by an MBO plan for the month of August 1996 and its subsequent evaluation by the trainer concerned (M. Chidosa). The National Project Coordinator monitors the programmes of the six trainers to ensure their compliance with the overall plan. This integrated approach functions well and gives the CTA a good overview of the project's progress. It also permits accurate quarterly reporting, an example of which is attached as Annex D.

The main training activity of the project is organized into five six-month training programmes of which the fifth (and final) is currently in progress. In addition, short courses in specific topics such as tie-dye/batik printing are organized as needed. In conjunction with the six-month courses and partly integrated with them, training of trainers (TOT) is being conducted. The second TOT programme is currently underway and will be completed by the end of the project. The output of this training, 22 trainers, was not included in the Project Document. The activity was added in response to urgent need for qualified trainers in rural areas.

In keeping with the approach explained in the Project Document, classroom work (3 days a week) is integrated with practical consultancy in the trainees\_ own businesses on a regular (monthly) basis. In addition to ensuring that the skills learned in the classroom are being correctly applied in the trainees own working environment, this also enables the trainer to monitor the progress and thus assess the effectiveness of the training. The information thus gathered is systematically tabulated and stored in the project's computerized data base.

Regular staff meetings provide a forum for comparing experiences and exchanging views on possible alternative approaches.

The only instance of cooperation with other developing countries (TCDC) in this project was the initial visits to Kenya by the project's staff to learn from the experiences of the UNIDO project in Nairobi (DP/KEN/90/019).

### 3.5 Assumptions

As already mentioned in Para 2.4 the main assumption, given as a prior obligation in the Project Document, was that the Government would provide adequate premises for the project. This did not materialize, and the project is operating in rented premises, paid for from the project budget. These premises are not ideal but this has not significantly affected the attainment of the project's stated outputs which, however, could have been exceeded had it not been for the constraints of space.

### 3.6 Project management

The project staff consists of the CTA, National Project Coordinator and six trainers supported by secretarial staff and a driver.

The product of this project, the training of women entrepreneurs, is now produced rather independently by the six trainers, coordinated by the CTA and the NPC. This is possible owing to the technical competence and commitment of the trainers. The planning of the work and its monitoring as described in para 3.4 function well. The CTA and her counterpart the NPC can thus limit themselves largely to overall guidance and administrative tasks. Their respective roles, although clearly spelled out in their job descriptions, are not always, in practice as clear as they should be. The planned gradual transfer of the CTA's duties to the NPC does not seem to be taking place in an organized and unambiguous fashion. There was a poor working relationship between the CTA and her chief Government counterpart, the Director of Women's Affairs at the Ministry of Community Development, Women's Affairs and Children. This put the NPC into a difficult situation where she has had to act as the sole intermediary between the Government and the project. It has limited the CTA's contact with the counterpart Ministry and, because the Director of Women's Affairs is also the Chairperson of the project's Steering Committee, led to a virtual exclusion of the Steering Committee from the affairs of the project.

The Steering Committee, constituted in accordance with the Project Document, has met only once after its initial establishment. The members of the Committee are very critical of this and blame the CTA for disregarding the Committee.

It is obvious that a useful management tool, an advisory body with influential membership, is being neglected here, and it would be advisable to rectify the situation urgently by convening a meeting of the Committee before the next Tripartite Review Meeting to seek the Committee's advice on central issues such as the modality of continuing the project's activities beyond the current termination date of January 1998.

Regrettable as the personal animosity between the CTA and the Director of Women's Affairs is, there is no evidence to suggest that it would have had any detrimental effect on the attainment of the project's objectives.

The nature of the project is such that, once set up, it continues functioning on the strength of its internal planning and monitoring system without much external influence. For the same reason UNIDO backstopping had an easy task. Headquarters staff participated in the formulation of the project and in two subsequent Tripartite Review Meetings, but there have been no major reasons for interference - if the non-fulfillment of the Government's prior obligation to provide adequate premises is conveniently disregarded.

The contact between the CTA and the backstopping staff at UNIDO Headquarters has been frequent, with almost daily exchanges of e-mail. This has ensured prompt response to requests from the field and kept UNIDO Headquarters fully abreast with events in the project - without, however leading to unnecessary interference from the Headquarters in the local management of the project by the CTA.

## **4. RESULTS**

### **4.1 Production of outputs**

**Output 1.** Market needs survey for product development.

This output, in the sense that was specified in the Product Document, was completed during the first year but the market survey activity was subsequently expanded in scope so as to become virtually an on-going activity that ensures relevance of the training program - especially in respect of new products.

**Output 2.** Six national experts exposed to the functioning of a similar project in Nairobi.

The output was satisfactorily completed at the beginning of the project.

**Output 3.** An operational training facility to accommodate the project.

The present facility, rented from a NGO Nyumba ya Sanaa is not ideal but it serves the purposes of the project and the training has been successfully conducted from these premises for nearly 18 months.

**Output 4.** Training documents on specific courses and methodology.

These were completed during the first year, but are constantly being adapted to the individual needs of the trainees.

**Output 5.** Administrative procedures addressing the issue of sustainability.

This has been discussed throughout the project's life and has led to the establishment of a credible fee structure for the training, an NGO to take over the project upon the termination of UNIDO's involvement and, finally, the development of a business plan and sustainability strategy for this NGO (Artisan Development Agency of Tanzania, ADAT). Completed to the extent possible at the present time.

**Output 6.** Database including information on material sourcing, market opportunities, credit sources and follow-up data on trainees.

The design and programming of the database was done at the beginning of the project; the accumulation of information has been an on-going activity. It is being used both for staff development and for monitoring the effect of the training.

**Output 7.** Retail outlet/showroom for products and practical market training.

This output has been deferred to a possible later phase as donor funds were not available for the purpose at this time.

**Output 8.** Report on findings and recommendations of environment consultant.

It was intended to sub-contract this activity to another, local UNIDO project (EP/GLO/95/002 Assistance to National Cleaner Production); however this cooperation has not materialized. To cover the subject matter the UNIDO backstopping officer conducted a three-day seminar in January 1996 the substance of which has been incorporated in the curricula.

**Output 9.** Report of national expert on traditional designs and production techniques.

Completed in February 1996. Practical application of the recommendations with respect to production techniques were limited because of cost. Traditional designs were already being used by the trainers.

**Output 10.** Tracer Study report.

The purpose of the study is given in the Project Document simply to follow up the activities of former trainees. The study was commissioned to a local consulting firm in May 1997 with the following terms of reference, prepared the project and cleared by UNIDO Headquarters:

1. Review all recorded documentation and data collected on past trainees data sheets held in project files.
2. Advise on collection methodology in relation to time spent on collection vs use or value of it to the beneficiaries, UNIDO, URT and the donor. (A cost analysis of this activity is necessary for the sustainability issue for long term planning.)
3. Collect information from past trainees within greater Dar es Salaam.
4. Collect information from current 6 months trainees.
5. Collect information from current Training of Trainers.
6. Evaluation of collected information identifying strengths and weaknesses with recommendations as applicable.
7. Preparation of report with four hard copies and one diskette LWP format to be submitted upon completion of study not later than four weeks from start of study.

The draft report, submitted in July 1997, was harshly criticized by the CTA, UCD and UNIDO but, to be fair to the consultant, his terms of reference also are open for criticism:

Item 1 of the TOR urges the consultant to review all recorded documentation but does not specify with respect to what.

Item 2 is rather unclear.

Items 3 - 5 simply urge the consultant to collect information without specifying what kind.

Item 6 calls for an evaluation of the collected information to identify strengths and weaknesses but does not say of what.

Item 7 calls for a report in four hard copies.

It would seem that since the progress of the trainees was being systematically monitored by the trainers during their field visits and the information thus collected in a standard format in the projects computerized database, that it would be useful to attempt to collect the same information also from past trainees.

Comparing that with the information collected during the training would yield data on the sustainability of the effect of the training received. That, surely, would be of interest to the Government, UNIDO and the donor. The consultant should thus be encouraged to look for comparative data on issues such as:

- growing of business,
- additional employment,
- number of other persons trained,
- access to credit,
- tendency to group formation, (for easier credit, etc)
- diversification of production.

**Output 11.** Manual on textile and textile product design.

Completed early 1997 by the projects national staff. Substance is integrated into the training program.

**4.2 Achievement of the immediate objective (effectiveness)**

When compared with the expected end-of-project situation as described in para B.2 of the Project Document the project has, by large, accomplished what it was set up to do:

- There is an operational and competent training center for the development of the entrepreneurial skills of businesswomen;
- The group training at the center is conducted by six professionally qualified and experienced national staff;
- A total of 160 trainees have completed one of the five 6-month training courses in addition to 22 who have been trained as trainers and who are now carrying out training programmes outside the project. Making the (conservative) assumption that each of those 22 trainers will have trained a further 10 persons during the first six months following the projects termination, one may conclude that a total of at least 400 women entrepreneurs have been trained as a direct and indirect consequence of the project;
- A computerized database has been set up and used to monitor the progress and effect of the training.
- The center now has a complete set of course curricula, adjusted to the specific requirements of each course and thus flexible and easily adaptable to the, often heterogenous, groups of trainees;

In terms of such concrete, quantified targets the project has undoubtedly achieved its objectives - even exceeded them. But when it comes to questions such as the creation of additional employment, building up national confidence, environmental issues and quality improvement, it becomes more difficult to measure the projects impact except through subjective assessment in the absence of usable yardsticks. Interviews with trainees who graduated from the first three courses and who, between them, cover performance levels A-B-C, reveal that all have improved the operations of their enterprises by adding at least one new product line, by being able to better track their cash flows and by being generally more confident in conducting their businesses. All this has not yet, however, translated into higher returns from their businesses owing to a difficult business climate.

The Tracer Study report confirms the positive effects of the training and concludes, among other things, that, ~~A~~compared with the baseline data the trainees\_ incomes have been growing and their net worth increased.@

This general conclusion is, however, somewhat suspect. It is based on interviews with 22 former trainees, selected from the 27 who responded to the initial questionnaire sent by the consultant to 78 former trainees. One must assume that those who responded, would be among the most active trainees whose performance during the training was likely to have been good and who would be likely to make the most of their training. If this assumption is correct, the sample of 22 is not representative of the trainees as a whole. However, the

evaluation team interviewed a different sample which it regarded as being more representative of the trainees as a whole. The results of these interviews neutralize the bias of the Tracer Study and one may conclude that more than 75 per cent of all trainees have benefited from the training.

Nearly all of the former trainees in the most successful group reported a significant increase in their income (50-100%) and attributed this to the training received. They had also increased the number of persons they employ by two or three and, in addition, assisted other artisans, friends and family members in improving their skills. This was confirmed in the interviews conducted by the evaluation team although, as mentioned above, the improvements in that group had not yet translated to higher incomes.

### 4.3 Contribution to the development objective

Accepting that the project has accomplished its objectives as set out in the Project Document it becomes a foregone conclusion that it has contributed - to the extent its resources have permitted - to the development objective of ~~A~~development of women's participation as entrepreneurs in the textile products sub-sector in Tanzania. <sup>@</sup> This has been confirmed in all interviews conducted by the evaluation team.

### 4.4 Sustainability

The question of sustainability has to be examined at two levels:

- (a) The sustainability of the effect of the training on the women entrepreneurs who participated in the courses offered by the center, and
- (b) the sustainability of the training center as a viable operation.

At the trainee level the Tracer Study should have established the sustainability of the effect of training had it been properly conducted. But even so, there are enough indications, both from the Tracer Study and from interviews of former trainees, conducted by the evaluation team, that the positive effect of the training has proved to be durable. This is definitely the case with the groups examined and there is no reason to assume that there would have been no durable effect on the rest.

The center itself, however, is not a financially viable operation at the present time. It has competent, dedicated and committed staff, its physical facilities, while not sumptuous, are adequate, it has good, adaptable and tested curricula for the areas of training it covers and it has a well-functioning system of work plans and the monitoring of results. But it is not yet financially viable - and cannot realistically be expected to be.

In rough figures, and using US\$ for the sake of smaller numbers, the total cost for running the Center for a month (excluding the cost of the CTA) is about US\$10,000 - consisting of:

staff salaries	78 %
rent and utilities	12 %
depreciation of equipment	6 %
miscellaneous	<u>4 %</u>
	100 %

Six months will thus cost US\$60,000 - and with 30 participants in each six month course, the cost per participant would be US\$2,000-. It might be possible to increase the number of participants in a course to 40 which would bring down the cost per participant to US\$1,500-, close to the figure reached in the Kenya project.

By comparison, the Center's savings from training fees (US\$55 per trainee), accumulated during two and a half years, amount to about US\$13,500. - enough to sustain the Center for less than two months after the termination of external assistance.

## 5. CONCLUSIONS

The project was formulated to address a clearly identifiable need - to enhance the technical and commercial capability of businesswomen manufacturing textile and related products. The Project Document is straight forward; its objective, outputs and activities well defined and quantified. It was implemented according to plan and most of its eleven outputs were satisfactorily produced.

It is essentially a group training project, with competent national staff responsible for the training, and, as such, it was always regarded as direct assistance as opposed to a capacity building project. In fact it should have been classified as being both direct support and capacity building, with appropriate provisions for sustaining the latter at the end of the external assistance. That was not done and, as a result, while the direct assistance (= training of women entrepreneurs) has been successfully completed and the quantified targets in the Project Document met, the facility itself is not financially viable and cannot continue to perform its training function without further financial assistance. The fact that an NGO has been established to function as an organizational body does not alleviate the need for external assistance. Such assistance would be well justified on the grounds that a functioning training facility, manned by an experienced team of competent and committed national trainers, is in place and has demonstrated its ability to meet the training needs of women entrepreneurs. Without further support the center will cease functioning within a couple of months.

It should be borne in mind, moreover, that training projects such as this probably cannot ever be self-sustaining. If the training fees were to be raised to a level where they would cover the costs, this would automatically exclude the very type of trainee whose needs the project aims to address.

**6. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- Complete a follow-up Project Document and its supporting information (Business Plan), emphasizing capacity building, and seek further external assistance to enable the Centre to continue its activities. (Government and UNIDO)
- Strengthen the established NGO (ADAT) by making it more broadly-based than it is at present. It would be especially important to include in its membership as many former trainees as possible to ensure continued relevance and development of the Centre's activities with a view of ADAT eventually becoming an autonomous body. The support of the Directorate for Women's Affairs in strengthening the role of ADAT is crucial.
- If the Centre's training activities continue as hoped and envisaged, and the number of trained entrepreneurs grows, a retail outlet/showroom will become essential. It should definitely be included in the planned activities of ADAT.
- Ensure full involvement of the Steering Committee in the affairs of both the present project in its final months and of its follow-up phase. (Government and UNIDO).

## 7. LESSONS LEARNED

Probably the single, most important lesson to be learned from this project is the need to look beyond the scheduled termination date of a project already at the time of its formulation, i.e. to consider the after-the-end-of-project situation. Had this been done with this project - with a concurrent analysis of the outputs - it would have been obvious from the outset that the project is essentially an institution-building project and not direct support. This would have forced the formulators to consider the sustainability question from the beginning and led to either a plausible solution - or to abandonment of the project idea.

From the project's eleven outputs, eight (Outputs 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 11) are of institution-building character and only three (Outputs 1, 2 and 10) are direct support. Yet, throughout the project's life, in the periodic Project Performance Reports (PPRs), the project is always referred to as a direct support project. It was evidently also approved as such by UNIDO, the Government and the donor - despite the fact that the cost of enhancing the skill level of 160 woman entrepreneurs at US\$ 6,000 - per person really must be regarded as excessive. A training project of this type would clearly make sense only if the initial outlay will yield higher returns over the long term. Stopping the effort at 160 trainees - while theoretically in line with national development objectives - will not have a noticeable impact on them and would not be cost-effective.

The existing project formulation guidelines do not really cover a situation such as this adequately. Drafted according to these guidelines the project has been formulated correctly and consequently, in this evaluation, its results have been weighed against its stated outputs and objectives and not been found wanting. Nevertheless, one is left with an uneasy feeling that all is not that perfect. Perhaps the time has come, particularly in view of dwindling resources, to take a harder look at the very type of projects UNIDO should be involved in.

For this particular project it is too late to change course drastically. The Centre is performing a useful service that deserves continuing financial support without which it cannot continue to function. It should continue its group training as a core activity - augmented, perhaps, by more lucrative short-term courses on specialized topics - until a sufficient number of woman entrepreneurs have been trained to a level where they could form, e.g. a cooperative, with the Centre as its marketing and materials supply channel.